

BOOK REVIEW

[The Clash of Civilisations and the Remarking of World Order By Samuel P Huntington, Viking Penguin India, New Delhi, 1997, Pages 367, Rs 395, ISBN 0-684-8164-2]

Number of theories have been projected about the type of world order that is likely to prevail in 21st Century. Some of these models are :-

(a) **Ecology Based Model.** Aftermath of global warming causing worldwide drought, submersion of large areas of coastal and island land mass, shortage of food, water etc may lead to bizarre partnership among nations and water wars.

(b) **Demographic Explosion Based Model.** Brown and Yellow races will expand disproportionately in world population. High pressure population areas of Asia will expand into low pressure areas of America and Australia. Use of force including weapons of mass destruction might be resorted to halt influx.

(c) **Wave Model by Alvin and Heidi Toffler.** It describes human history going through a series of waves. Each wave is based on the means by which wealth is created. First and Second wave civilisation were based on agricultural and industrial revolution. Presently we are in the era of third wave civilisation based on knowledge revolution introduced by computer related technology.

(d) **Clash of Civilisation.** This is propagated by Professor Samuel P Huntington. He asks, "What will be the fundamental source of conflict in this new world?" and answers, "My hypothesis is that it will not be primarily ideological nor economic. The great divisions will be cultural. The clash of civilisations will dominate global politics." Out of above four models clash of civilisations has generated the most discussions and controversy. In the summer 1993 issue of prestigious Foreign Affairs journal the article named "Clash of Civilisations?" was first published. It generated considerable heat in the intellectual circle. Since then Prof Huntington has expanded on his article, explored further issues raised in 1993 article and developed many new and controversial analyses. In 1993 he raised the question whether conflicts between civilisations would dominated the future of world politics. In the book under review he postulates that not only the clashes between civilisations are the greatest threat to world peace but also how an international order based on civilisation is the best safeguard against wars.

The credentials of the author of the book compels one to read the book carefully. Prof Samuel P Huntington has been chairman. Harvard Academy for International and Area Studies, Director for Security Planning in the National Security Council during the Carter Administration, founder and co-editor of Foreign Policy and President of American Political Science Association. His book, Soldier and the State

has been a masterpiece and adorn the shelf of all libraries concerning defence studies worth the name.

The author is held in high regard and has the capability in helping the thinking and tilting of US Foreign Policy one way or the other. After the end of the cold war the author clearly shows the worries of Western World specially about Islamic resurgence, cultural suicide and political disunity of West, rise of Chinese assertiveness, religious revival etc.

Prof Huntington has identified the following contemporary civilisations :-

- * **Sinnic.** Common culture of China and Chinese communities in South East Asia and elsewhere outside of China as well as related culture of Vietnam and Korea. Initially in 1993 he labelled this civilisation as Confucian.
- * **Japanese.** Offspring of Chinese civilisation. It is a state.
- * **Hindu.** Hinduism has been central to the culture of the subcontinent since second millennium BC.
- * **Islamic.** Many distinct cultures or sub civilisations exist within Islam including Arab, Turkie, Persian and Malay.
- * **Western.** Maj components being in Europe, North America, Australia and New Zealand.
- * **Latin America.**
- * **Africa.**

In this highly provocative book Prof Huntington devotes lot of space to the threat perceptions from the Islamic civilisation and to a lesser extent from the Confucian culture to Western world specially US interests. He provides data to advance his theory. Some of the data quoted by him are :-

- * West controls 24 percents of territory, has 19 percent of population, 48 percents of gross economic output, and commands 21 percent of military manpower. The respective figures of two other contending cultures were 21 and 7.5 percent for Islamic and Sinic cultures in terms of territory, 19 and 21 for population, 11 and 10 for economic output and 20 and 21 percent for military manpower.
- * Overall Muslims constituted 18 percent of world's population in 1980, likely to be over 20 percent in 2000 and 30 percent in 2025.

* In 1958 roughly 9.8 percent of human beings spoke English as a first or Second language. In 1992, 7.6 percent did. In 1958 24 percent of humans spoke one of five major Western languages; in 1992 less than 21 percent did.

* Western Christians make up 30 percent of world's population, but the proportion is declining steadily and at some point at next decade or so the number of Muslims will exceed the number of Christians. The west is in retreat with respect to two central elements of culture, language and religion.

Because of these reasons the Prof says. "In a multipolar, multicivilisational world, the West's responsibility is to secure its own interests, not to promote those of other people nor to attempt to settle conflicts between other people when those conflicts are of little or no consequence to the West". And the Prof leaves no ambiguity in stating "Islam has bloody borders", which attracted critical comments from all over the world and from where he perceives maximum immediate threat to the Western World. Since there is no immediate threat reckoned by the Prof from Hindu or African Civilisations, he has not deliberated upon these civilisations at all.

Though the brilliant and highly provocative book has number of contradictions he draws attention to number of issues which merit deliberations :-

* A world of clashing civilisations is inevitably a world of double standards : people apply one standard to their kin countries and a different standard to others.

* Decisions made at the UN Security Council or in the International Monetary Fund that reflects the interests of the West are presented to the world as reflecting the desires of world community. The very phrase the "world community" has become the euphemistic collective noun (replacing "free world") to give global legitimacy to actions reflecting interests of the United States and other Western powers.

* America's efforts to promote Western culture as the universal culture and its declining ability to do so. USA believes that non Western people should commit themselves to western values of democracy, free market, limited government, separation of church and state, human rights, individualism and the rule of law and should embody these values in their institutions.

* Non Westerners do not hesitate to point to the gaps between Western principle and Western practice. Hypocrisy and double standards are the price of Universalist pretensions. Democracy is promoted, but not if it brings Islamic fundamentalists to power, non proliferation is preached for Iran and Iraq , but nor for Israel, free trade is the elixir of economic growth but not for agriculture, human rights are an issue with China but not with Saudi Arabia, aggression against oil owning Kuwait is

repulsed with massive force, but not so for aggression against oil less Bosnians.

* Moral decline, cultural suicide and political disunity of the West which includes :-

- Increase in antisocial behaviour such as crime , drug use and violence.
- Family decay , increased rate of divorce, illegitimacy, teen age pregnancy, single parent families.
- General weakening of work ethic and rise of cult of personal indulgence.
- Decreasing commitment to learning and intellectual activity, manifested in United States in lower circle of scholarstic achievements.

Towards the end the learned Professor has prescribed the following for USA, the most powerful Western country, to safeguard the interests of Western Civilisation :-

* To achieve greater political, economic and military integration and to coordinate their policies so as to preclude states from other civilisations exploiting differences among them.

* To incorporate into European Union and NATO the Western States of Central Europe i.e, the Baltic Republics, Slovenia and Croatia.

* To encourage the “ Westernization ” of Latin America.

* To restrain the development of the conventional and unconventional military powers of Islamic and Sinic States.

* To slow the drift of Japan away from the West and towards accommodation with China.

* To accept Russia as the core state of orthodoxy and a major regional power with legitimate interests in the security of its Southern borders.

* To maintain Western Technologies and military superiority over other civilisations .

* And most important, to recognize that Western intervention in the affairs of other civilisations is probably the single most dangerous source of instability and potential global conflict in a multicivilisational world.

There has been debates galore over various issues raised by Prof Huntington viz :-

* Civilisations do not control states, states control civilisations.

* Conflicts of economic and political interest are becoming more and more common among the major nations of the world, and more and more tense. Neither civilisation nor culture has become fundamental source of conflict in the new world.

* In the twentieth century most violent conflicts have occurred within civilisations : Stalin's purges, Pol Pot's genocide, the Nazi holocaust and World War II. Over the centuries difference between civilisations may not have led to the longest and most violent conflicts.

* The theory does not cater for impact of economic and technological revolution.

Reader does not have to agree with whatever the another analyses about the forces driving global politics today and into 21st century. However, it is one of the most important and most talked about books of the decade and is a must read for all interested in understanding the realities of global politics in the 21st century.

Published in Pinnacle, September 2002.

BOOK REVIEW

An Insider's Experience of **Insurgency in India's North-East**

Lt General J R Mukherjee
PVSM, AVSM, VSM (Retd)



ANTHEM SOUTH ASIAN STUDIES



Lt General J R Mukherjee
PVSM, AVSM, VSM (Retd),
is an alumnus from the National
Defence Academy. He was
commissioned into the infantry of
the Assam Regiment of the Indian
Army in 1964 and retired in 2005
as Chief of Staff, Eastern
Command, Indian Army.

An Insider's Experience of
Insurgency in India's North-East

'Soldier's talk by a soldier - Lt General Mukherjee gives a crisp, unvarnished account of our north-east and what ails it, with empathy, emphasis, and the personal knowledge of someone who has been there. I strongly support and fully endorse everything that Lt General Mukherjee has said in his book. But the problem is: will anyone who matters ever read this book? Will anyone listen?'

*General Shankar Roychowdhury PVSM (Retd),
Former Chief of Army Staff, Indian Army*

'I write this book, as like many of us, I feel agitated at the way in which those in authority handle the north-east. Over 41 years ago, I was commissioned into the ASSAM Regiment, who recruit from the entire north-east, and have been in close touch with the men of my regiment, the ex-servicemen and their families. I have served for twenty-four years all over the north-east in a wide variety of appointments, and have had extensive contact with the people. I have, as a result of my close association, developed a great deal of love for the region's people. One of my aims in writing this book is therefore to put across the frank views and acute dissatisfaction that most of the people of the north-east, including many bureaucrats, government and police officials, politicians, intellectuals and technocrats feel, but do not have the energy or the will to express.'

Lt General J R Mukherjee, PVSM, AVSM, VSM (Retd)

Anthem South Asian Studies

Series Editor: Crispin Bates Ph.D., Department of History, University of Edinburgh.

Anthem South Asian Studies provides comprehensive coverage of all aspects of the region, past and present. Guided by a team of leading academics and thinkers from around the world, the series focuses on key issues in fields ranging from economics and politics to history and the fine arts, and will appeal to academics, students and general readers alike.

ISBN 1-84331-700-1



9 781843 317005

Anthem Press

www.anthempress.com

Cover illustration
Chabi Datt

[An Insider's Experience Of Insurgency in India's North East, Lt Gen J R Mukherjee, PVSM, AVSM, VSM (Retd), Anthem South Asian Studies, Anthem Press, 2005]

Large number of Army officers spend considerable time of their life in our North East and J&K fighting insurgency and proxy war. Because of the job content, genuine interest and empathy for the local people some officers study the problem in its entirety and have very detailed knowledge of the geography, history, culture, demography, anthropology and intricacies of the problem both from the point of view of being in uniform and out of it. However, very few of them have written on their experience and views on the subject. This book under review is an excellent addition to the already published material on the touchy subject of problems in North East.

One could not have found a better person to write on North East. Lt Gen J R Mukherjee, PVSM, AVSM, VSM (Retd) has spent 24 years all over North East in various capacities from company commander to Brigade and Divisional Commander and as BGS of IV Corps and COS of HQ Eastern Command. In between he has also served as COS of HQ 15 Corps during Kargil operations and later went on to command the same Corps with distinction. Being from the ASSAM Regiment which has soldiers from entire North East and then as Colonel of the ASSAM Regiment the General has intimate knowledge of the people of the region. Having seen the insurgency and proxy war very closely both in North East and in J&K, the General takes a close look at the problems dispassionately with considerable empathy for the people affected and produced an excellent crisp book which must adorn any library from unit level to government organizations and think tanks alike.

The book has been organized into 13 chapters starting with Effects of Geography and History, then one chapter each for Assam, Manipur, Meghalaya, Mizoram and Tripura, Arunachal, Sikkim and North Bengal. Other chapters include Role of Servicemen(SM) and Ex Servicemen(ESM) in the region, India's Foreign Relations, the Effect of Geo Power Politics and events in neighbouring countries, India's Foreign Policy with reference to the North East, Internal Socio Political Aspects, Economic Aspects, Politico Military Aspects and Views on Problem Resolution for the North East. While discussing a particular state apart from its population and demography, language, general problems of the state and insurgencies, the inter relation between various groups within and outside the state and effect of neighbouring states have been brought out clearly. Interestingly the author has included North Bengal and Sikkim as part of North East for very valid reasons as these two are closely interlinked with the problems of North East

Some of the suggestions by the author which merit immediate deliberations are:-

- Switch from existing structure of “majority rule” to “consociation politics”. It calls for high degree of inter ethnic cooperation.
- State boundaries should be considered mainly for administrative reasons.
- Doing away inner line restrictions while allaying tribal fears of being swamped by outsiders.
- Increased economic interaction and a quickened pace of modernization especially in Information Technology.
- Improved surface and air communications.
- Development of local entrepreneurs.
- Focusing on the preparing for the future when the Asian Highway brings with it a host of benefits and negative influences.
- Problem resolution with Pakistan will take time and through discussion, economic activities, trade, cultural activities and people to people contact and progression through economic union of states.
- Use of ESM for development.

Some facts stated by the author which are known to all who deal with North East at macro level merit reiteration for information of all:-

- ✓ Total dependence on central funds promoted passiveness amongst the people. There is parallel and huge “black” economy run by terrorist organizations.
- ✓ In Nagaland the NSCN(I&M) openly extorts taxes from all sources including politicians, government servants and public sector undertakings. The doles made by Delhi to Nagaland are finding their way into NSCN coffers. The primary focus and strategy of the national counter insurgency efforts of all agencies need to switch primarily to denial of funds to the insurgents. Without funds insurgency will die out on its own accord.
- ✓ There are numerous cases where the businessmen are banking and investing insurgent group funds and carrying out hawala transactions for the insurgent groups for a profit. These businessmen literally control the finances of North Eastern states and are in league with both the state administrations and the insurgents. This amounts to treason and needs to be very sternly dealt with.
- ✓ **Principles of CounterInsurgency.** Try and win the hearts and mind of the people, Denial of foreign support and neutralization of the insurgents.
- ✓ When the insurgents feel they are cornered, they open fire first– in the army’s case it must first satisfy itself that public order is at stake, issue a warning and then only resort to firing- consequently many soldiers die- **Where are the Army’s Human Rights?**
- ✓ Resolution of problems with the NSCN(I&M) will automatically resolve insurgency in the North East as the NSCN(I&M) is the mother organization to most of the insurgent groups is a total fallacy.
- ✓ Situation in Manipur is critical much worse than J&K and deteriorating further. Writ of the Indian government does not run in Manipur. Because of unofficial cease fire in the claimed areas of NSCN(I&M) which include almost the whole of Manipur CI operations are currently on against Meitei insurgent groups whereas NSCN(I&M) has a free run in Manipur. The Meiteis though have fielded maximum people from the North East in the national sports teams, the bureaucracy, police, armed forces and other central services- feel alienated. The Meitei insurgent elements have launched in retaliation a sustained campaign to malign the Indian government and the SF. There is strong nexus between the insurgents and politicians. Manipur must get all weather road access to all neighbouring states, particularly Assam so that the Meiteis are not intimidated by all and sundry.

Role of ESM and SM . There are large number of ESM and SM from the Armed Forces as well as from PMF/CPOs in the North Eastern states. Since these personnel are rotated all over India during their service their outlook becomes much wider than their brethren in the villages. After retirement they hardly get any opportunity for re employment or any avenue to utilize their organization and administrative skills and discipline in the North Eastern states. The author has, with the help of statistics, shown how they are distributed across the North East and with the help of their **family unit** consisting of father mother and three children and **expanded family unit** consisting of his brothers and sisters and their children can be useful.

State	ESM+SM incl PMF/CPOs	% of Total Population	% of Population of Family Unit	% of Population Expanded Family Unit
Ukhrul Dist of Manipur	10,000	7%	30%	65-70%
Other Hill Districts of Manipur		SIMILAR		
Meitei Areas	15,000- 20,000	-	-	15%
Nagaland	20,000	1%	5%	12%
Mizoram	15,000	2%	10%	20%
Assam	45,000	2%	10%	20%
Tripura	2,500	-	-	-
Arunachal	3,000	-	-	2-3%
Meghalaya	3,000	-	-	2%
Sikkim	250	-	-	< 0.5%
North Bengal	30,000#	-	3%	-

Majority from Gorkhas from Darjeeling and Jalpaiguri Districts.

The author has forcefully pleaded the case of these ESM to restructure existing pattern of welfare of separated families of SM and ESM and their families He urged the Armed Forces and Assam Rifles to do much more than what is being done routinely like holding ESM rallies. He has recommended ESMs to form co-operative business enterprises aimed at generating employment, income and thereby welfare. There is enormous scope in running transport services, construction, security services, agriculture farming, bamboo industry, herb culture, fish farming and export, handicrafts, tourism, horticulture, floriculture and so on. Such systems exist in many countries the world over including USA, Israel, Pakistan and China.

The reviewer has heard one interesting observation a decade back from Lt Gen S C Sardeshpande, UYSM(Retd) while he was on a private visit after retirement to Baramulla to meet our GOC, a fellow and distinct Kumaoni soldier. He said that there are large number of ESM in our country. The numbers are enough to put pressure on the government of the day for their welfare measures. There are number of organizations of ESMs. Yet none of them would have a senior officer to be at the helm of their affairs! One has to critically look into this aspect. Numbers count and politicians understand numbers.

This reviewer was Sparrow of the then Brig J R Mukherjee when he was commanding a Mountain Brigade at the foothills of Dooars in Silliguri corridor and is privy to his forthrightness, radical approach and sharp intellect. One expected more candid introspection. For example, we are fighting counterinsurgency operations for more than 50 years. What is the national policy of CI Ops in North East? Is there any long term

government policy? Governments can change, mid term connections can be done but we must have a long term strategy. Though the author has mentioned that GNLF agitation started with ESM but denied involvement of ESM in NSCN(IM). What should be our policy of handling ESM, SM and their families in North East J&K and now from Nepal, and states/districts under the influence of Maoists? What should be the civil military relation model? Things will be different for different states but there should be a model of Unified Commands. With hindsight, personalities involved, organizational constraints, role limitations of PMF/CPO/State Police, state governments and Governors taken into account by this time we should have arrived at some model. Issues regarding Inter Agency Cooperation, intelligence specially actionable intelligence (can the army create it?), networking by commanders and staff could have been highlighted. If we have to fight CI Ops it is time to discuss these issues threadbare and arrive at a consensus. Whether we like it or not we have to fight jointly with PMF/CPO/Local Police and the state government agencies. It is time for some tough talking. Various ethnic groups in North East must realise the solution to the problems have to come from them only. For example in Meghalaya the Khasis and Garos have to come to terms. In Nagaland the Tangkhuls, other tribes, the Kukis have to resolve their problems. No longer they can expect central government with a magic wand will solve all their problems. Enough funds are being pumped into the region. The people have to decide what they want to do to progress. Otherwise all the 10% GDP growth rate and economic prosperity in neighbouring ASEAN countries will go by the warring factions and they will remain in the quagmire that is North East.

ARTRAC must utilize the experience, knowledge, expertise and vision of such eminent and proud soldiers like Generals JR Mukherjee or Rustam Nanavatty et al who have spent most part of their lives fighting CI Ops and proxy war and evolve Indian Army's counter insurgency doctrine. This immense knowledge and wisdom of such distinguished soldiers must not be allowed to go waste.

Last but not the least the book with all its wealth of information is only of 128 pages.

Published in Pinnacle, April 2006 issue.